



Recommended Citation

Peter Hayes, " ", NAPSNet Special Reports, January 06, 2015,
<https://nautilus.org/napsnet/napsnet-special-reports/%eb%8f%99%eb%b6%81%ec%95%8-%84%ed%95%b5%ec%a7%80%eb%8c%80%eb%a5%bc-%ed%86%b5%ed%95%9c-%ed%95%5-%ec%9c%84%ed%98%91%ec%9d%98-%ec%a2%85%ec%8b%9d/>

[1]

()

<http://www.kdjlibrary.org/>

6 January 2015

[English version \(\) here](#)

가 , 가

()가 , .

가 ,

가

가

가

가

가

, .

가

가

가 ,

1.

:

가 (orders of magnitude)

가 ,

가

가

가

가

가

[\[1\]](#)

2.

:

가 , 3 ,

“ ” (가

)

가

“ ”(가가

)

, “ ”(가가

,)

“

가

가

가

가

가

가

가

3

가

, 가

가

[\[2\]](#)

3.

:

, 가

, 가

, ,

,

,

가

가

, ,

, ,

,

(general and immediate)' 가 가 .[3]

4. : 1958 - 1976 8 , 가
(, 가 , 가 , 가) .

5. : 가 , 1976 8 “ 3 (Paul Bunyan)”
()
1970 , 가
. 1975 90 가
() 가
(1986 가) .

6. : 1990 (200 가 1992 2) .
28 W .[4] 1991 9 .[5]

7. : () .
가 가 가 () .[6]
. [7] 1990 21 , 가 가

가 , 가

1991 가 가 [8]

가 1990

8. : 1990 [9]

9. : 2000

2013 " " 2006 , 2009 , , 2012

2012 (NPT)

10. : 2010 (NPR)

2010 NPR 가가 [10]

2010 가 2013

1991 2013 4 가

(가)

11.3 : 3

가

12. 가 :가 (DMZ)

가

13. 가 :

가 가 .6
" " 가 가 가
가 (reshape) 가 가 가

a)

b) 가 가

c)

14. : 가 40
가 [11]

가 가 [12] 가

15. 가 :

가 가 7 " 가 [13] 2014 10

21 " 가 [14] "

16. 가 : 6가

1.

2.

3. 가

- 4.
- 5.
- 6.

가 가
 가 ,
 .
 ,
 17. : , NPT
 가 .[15]
 , NPT IAEA 가 ,
 “ ”) .
 가 가
 가

18. 가 : 가 가 .[16]
 .NPT 가 , , , , 가
 .[17] NPT 가
 .[18]

19. : “3+3” [19] , , 3 ,
 , 3 가 . 2010 가 3+2
 가 ,
 가 NPT 5 4
 가,
 (contingent status)
 “5+4.5” “5+5” ()

20. : 가 IAEA 가
 가
 .[20] “ ” IAEA 가 ,
 가
 가
 가
 가
 가
 가
 가

21. 가 : , , . NPT가
 가 가 1994 " " 가
 가 , , 가 .
 가 , 가
 . 가
 , 가
 가 IAEA 가 . 가가 , 가
 가 가
 가 가 가
 가 가
 가 가
 가 가

22. : 가 가
 .
 NPT 가 가 .
 , 가 " (nuclear existential deterrence)"
 , 가 , , ,
 가
 , 가 , 가가 가
 , 가 가
 가 .
 , 가
 가 , ()
 가 , , 가 , NPT IAEA 가
 가 가 가
 . 가) , 가 (

가 .

가 , 가
가 . 가
가

23.

가 .
:
가

, , ,
가 ,

가

가

24.

?:

가 가 . 가

가

, 가 가 가

가

[22] NPT IAEA

가

가

가

가

가

가

25.

가

:
(NPT

NPT

). [23]

. 가

26.

:

가

가

가

(
).

27.

:

가

(Eminent Persons

Group) 가

a)

가?

b)

가((

가,

)?

c)

가?

가

가?

d)

가?

e)

가?

f)

가

가?

가

가

가?

g)

1991

가(

가

가

가

)?

h)

가

(

)?

12

i)

)?

(

[1] (Richard Tanter)

- (Michael Hamel-Green)

phayes@nautilus.org

ENDNOTES

[1] . "Doctrines and Strategies Concerning Nuclear Weapons," in UN Secretary General, *Nuclear Weapons: A Comprehensive Study*, chapter 4, pp. 41-56, Department for Disarmament Affairs, United Nations,

New York, 1991, at:

<http://www.un.org/disarmament/HomePage/ODAPublications/DisarmamentStudySeries/PDF/SS-21.pdf> which updates earlier UN expert studies on nuclear weapons dating back to the original study, ***Effects of the Possible Use of Nuclear Weapons and the Security and Economic Implications For States of the Acquisition and Further Development of These Weapons***, Report of the Secretary-General, United Nations, New York, Sales No. E.68.IX, New York, 1968.

[2] Paul Bracken, *The Command and Control of Nuclear Forces* Yale University Press, New Haven, 1983; P. Lewis et al, *Too Close for Comfort: Cases of Near Nuclear Use and Options for Policy*, Chatham House, *The Royal Institute of International Affairs*, London, 2014, at: http://www.chathamhouse.org/sites/files/chathamhouse/home/chatham/public_html/sites/default/files/20140428TooCloseforComfortNuclearUseLewisWilliamsPelopidasAghlani.pdf

[3] Patrick Morgan, *Deterrence: a conceptual analysis*, Sage Publications, 1977.

[4] US Pacific Command, *Command History, 1991, Office of the Historian, volume 1, released under US FOIA to Nautilus institute*, p. 90 *et passim*, at: <https://nautilus.org/wp-content/uploads/2011/12/koreawithdrawal.pdf>

[5] Susan Koch, *The Presidential Nuclear Initiatives of 1991-1992*, WMD Case Study 5, Center for the Study of Weapons of Mass Destruction, National Defense University, Washington DC, October 1, 2012, at: <http://wmdcenter.dodlive.mil/files/2012/10/CSWMD-Case-Study-5-for-web.pdf>

[6] (recession) .
, 가 , 가
 . P. Morgan, "Considerations Bearing on a Possible Retraction of The American Nuclear Umbrella Over the ROK," prepared for Nautilus Institute, June 21, 2009 and published by National Committee on North Korea, Washington DC, in October 2009 at: http://www.ncnk.org/resources/publications/Morgan%20Considerations%20Bearing_on_a_Possible_Retractation_of_the_American_Nuclear_Umbrella.pdf

[7] Eric Schmitt, "Bush's Arm Plan; Cheney Orders Bombers Off Alert, Starting Sharp Nuclear Pullback," *New York Times*, September 29, 1991, at: <http://www.nytimes.com/1991/09/29/world/bush-s-arm-plan-cheney-orders-bombers-off-alert-starting-sharp-nuclear-pullback.html?pagewanted=all&src=pm>

[8] T. Nichols, "The Case for Conventional Deterrence," *The National Interest*, April 20, 2014, at: <http://nationalinterest.org/commentary/the-case-conventional-deterrence-9381>

[9] (Patrick Morgan) 1991-2002 . "Deterrence and System Management: The Case of North Korea," *Conflict Management and Peace Science* 2006; 23; 121-138. 2008 가 . P. Hayes, S. Bruce, "North Korean Nuclear Nationalism and the Threat of Nuclear War in Korea," *Pacific Focus*, 26, 2011, pp. 65-89, at: <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/j.1976-5118.2011.01056.x/abstract>

and P. Hayes, R. Cavazos, "North Korean and US Nuclear Threats: Discerning Signals from Noise," *The Asia-Pacific Journal*, 11:14:2, April 8, 2013, at: <http://japanfocus.org/-Roger-Cavazos/3924#>

[10] P. Hayes, J. Lewis, "The DPRK and the Warsaw Clause: An Unnoticed Change in US Nuclear Policy", NAPSNet Policy Forum, July 28, 2011, <https://nautilus.org/napsnet/napsnet-policy-forum/the-dprk-and-the-warsaw-clause-an-unnoticed-change-in-us-nuclear-policy/>

[11] K. Vignard, ed, *Nuclear Weapons Free Zones*, UNIDIR, *Disarmament Forum*, 2: 2011, Geneva, at: <http://www.unidir.org/files/publications/pdfs/nuclear-weapon-free-zones-en-314.pdf> "2011

, 193 가 138 , (가)
1959 (가 47), 1967
(33 가), 1985 가 (13 가),
1995 (10 가), 1996 (30 가, 21 가)
, 2006 (5 가)가

." Hamel-Green, M., *Regions That Say No: Precedents and Precursors for Denuclearizing Northeast Asia*, East Asia Nuclear Security Workshop, Tokyo, Japan (November 2011) at:

<http://nautilus.wpengine.netdna-cdn.com/wp-content/uploads/2011/12/Hamel-Green---TOKYONEANWFZPAPERvs5.pdf>

1998 " 가 " (53/77D)
가 가
1992
가
(CTBT), 가

[12] B. Kampmark et al, *A New Approach to Security in Northeast Asia: Breaking the Gridlock*, Summary Report, Breaking the Gridlock Workshop, October 9-10, 2012, Woodrow Wilson International Center for Scholars, Washington, D.C., at: <https://nautilus.org/napsnet/napsnet-special-reports/gridlockworkshopsummary/#axzz31SQamTGM>

[13] *Work of the Advisory Board on Disarmament Matters, Report of the Secretary-General to UN General Assembly*, A/68/206, July 26, 2013, at: [https://disarmament-library.un.org/UNODA/Library.nsf/a45bed59c24a1b6085257b100050103a/f82ba7fcf1be289085257bce006a670a/\\$FILE/A%2068%20206.pdf](https://disarmament-library.un.org/UNODA/Library.nsf/a45bed59c24a1b6085257b100050103a/f82ba7fcf1be289085257bce006a670a/$FILE/A%2068%20206.pdf)

[14] KCNA, "U.S. Can Never Evade Blame for Blocking Solution to Nuclear Issue: Rodong Sinmun," October 21, 2014 at: <http://www.kcna.co.jp/item/2014/201410/news21/20141021-11ee.html>

[15] United Nations, "Establishment of nuclear-weapon-free zones on the basis of arrangements freely arrived at among the States of the region concerned," Annex 1, *Report of the Disarmament Commission*, General Assembly, 54th session, Supplement No. 42 (A/54/42), United Nations, New York, 1999, p. 7, at: http://www.opanal.org/Docs/Desarme/NWFZ/A54_42iAnnexI.pdf

[16] This section draws on Peter Hayes and Richard Tanter, "Key Elements of Northeast Asia Nuclear-Weapons Free Zone (NEA-NWFZ)", *NAPSNet Policy Forum*, November 13, 2012, <https://nautilus.org/napsnet/napsnet-policy-forum/key-elements-of-northeast-asia->

[17]

가 가 . 1991 “ ”

“ 가 ”

가 24 1991

B-61 가

가 2

가 3 /

가 3

가

12

President Bush’s statement is “BUSH’S ARMS PLAN; Remarks by President Bush on Reducing U.S. and Soviet Nuclear Weapons,” New York Times, September 28, 1991, at: <http://www.nytimes.com/1991/09/28/us/bush-s-arms-plan-remarks-president-bush-reducing-us-soviet-nuclear-weapons.html?pagewanted=all&src=pm> Powell is cited in Eric Schmitt, “Bush’s Arm Plan; Cheney Orders Bombers Off Alert, Starting Sharp Nuclear Pullback,” New York Times, September 29, 1991, at: <http://www.nytimes.com/1991/09/29/world/bush-s-arm-plan-cheney-orders-bombers-off-alert-starting-sharp-nuclear-pullback.html?pagewanted=all&src=pm>

On Japan’s transit policy and territorial waters, see Chi-Young Pak, *The Korean Straits*, Martinus Nijhoff, 1988, pp. 79-81; on recent Chinese naval surface and submarine transit of the straits and Japanese response, see Peter Dutton, *Scouting, Signaling, and Gatekeeping, Chinese Naval Operations in Japanese Waters and the International Law Implications*, China Maritime Studies Institute, U.S. Naval War College, Newport, Rhode Island, at: www.usnwc.edu/cnws/cmsi/default.aspx

[18]

2 “ ”

” 가

S.W. Cheon as a “Pan-Pacific nuclear weapon free zone (PPNWFZ), encompassing East Asia, South Pacific and Latin America.” In S.W. Cheon, “The Limited Nuclear Weapon Free Zone in Northeast Asia: Is It Feasible?” *The Mongolian Journal of International Affairs*, 14, 2007, p. 115, at: [http://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=the%20limited%20nuclear%20weapon%20free%20zone%20in%20northeast%20asia%3A%20is%20it%20feasible&source=web&cd=10&ved=0CGIQFjAJ&url=http%3A%2F%2Fjournals.sfu.ca%2Fmongoliajol%2Findex.php%2FMJIA%2Farticle%2Fdownload%](http://www.google.com/url?sa=t&rct=j&q=the%20limited%20nuclear%20weapon%20free%20zone%20in%20northeast%20asia%3A%20is%20it%20feasible&source=web&cd=10&ved=0CGIQFjAJ&url=http%3A%2F%2Fjournals.sfu.ca%2Fmongoliajol%2Findex.php%2FMJIA%2Farticle%2Fdownload%2F)

[19] 15 DMZ 1000km

J. Endicott, "Limited nuclear-weapon-free zones: the time has come," *Korean Journal of Defense Analysis*, 20: 1, 2008, p. 17, at: <http://dx.doi.org/10.1080/10163270802006305>.

S. W. Cheon, *op cit*, pp. 106-115.

'3+3' H. Umabayashi, "A Northeast Asia Nuclear-Weapon-Free Zone with a Three Plus Three Arrangement," East Asia Nuclear Security Workshop, Tokyo, Japan, November 2011, at: http://nautilus.wpengine.netdna-cdn.com/wp-content/uploads/2011/12/UMEBAYASHI--A-NEA-NWFZ-with-3-3-Arrangement-2011--Tokyo_.pdf; and similarly, Kumao Kaneko, "Japan needs no umbrella," *Bulletin of the Atomic Scientists*, March/April 1996, pp. 46-51, at: <http://www.thebulletin.org/>

The first proposal phased implementation of a 3+3 concept is found in S. W. Cheon and T. Suzuki, "The Tripartite Nuclear-Weapon-Free Zone in Northeast Asia: a Long-Term Objective of the Six Party Talks," *International Journal of Korean Studies*, 12, 2, 2003, pp. 41-68, at: http://www.kinu.or.kr/eng/pub/pub_03_01.jsp?page=2&num=42&mode=view&field=&text=&order=&dir=&bid=DATA03&ses=&category=11

'3+2' Korea-Japan Nuclear Weapon Free Zone (KJNWFZ) Briefing Paper, May 6, 2010, in English, Korean, and Japanese, at: <https://nautilus.org/projects/by-name/korea-jap-nwzf/>

[20] D. Albright, C. Hinderstein, *Cooperative Verified Dismantlement of Nuclear Programs: An Eye Toward North Korea*, **June 1, 2003**, at: <http://isis-online.org/conferences/detail/cooperative-verified-dismantlement-of-nuclear-programs-an-eye-toward-north-/10> and Andre Buys, *Proliferation Risk Assessment of Former Nuclear Explosives/Weapons Program Personnel: South African Case Study*, *NAPSNet Special Report*, July 14, 2011, at: www.nautilus.org/publications/essays/napsnet/reports/Buys-research-report-final.pdf and A. Buys, *Tracking nuclear capable individuals*, *NAPSNet Special Report*, **Nautilus Institute, April 19, 2011**, at: http://nautilus.wpengine.netdna-cdn.com/wp-content/uploads/2011/12/Tracking_Nuclear_Individuals_Buys.pdf

[21] 가 . J. Dhanapala, "NWFZS and Extended Nuclear Deterrence: Squaring the Circle?" *NAPSNet Special Report*, May 1, 2012, at: <https://nautilus.org/napsnet/napsnet-special-reports/nwfs-and-extended-nuclear-deterrence-squaring-the-circle/> 1975

가 , 가 . *Comprehensive Study Of The Question Of Nuclear-Weapon-Free Zones In All Its Aspects*, Special report of the Conference of the Committee on Disarmament , UN Doc. A/10027/Add. 1, New York, 1975 <http://www.un.org/disarmament/HomePage/ODAPublications/DisarmamentStudySeries/PDF/A-10027-Add1.pdf>

[22] 가 가 . 28 3

“ , ”
(Alfonso Garcia Robles)
가가

가

가 가 , .” M. Hamel-Green, “Implementing a Korea-Japan Nuclear-Weapon-Free Zone: Precedents, Legal Forms, Governance, Scope, Domain, Verification, Compliance and Regional Benefits,” *Pacific Focus*, 26:1, April, 2011, pp. 97-98, at: <http://onlinelibrary.wiley.com/doi/10.1111/pafo.2011.26.issue-1/issuetoc>

[23] KCNA, “FM Spokesman on Right to Bolster Nuclear Deterrent” May 26, 2010 at:

<http://www.kcna.co.jp/item/2010/201005/news24/20100524-15ee.html>

View this online at: <https://nautilus.org/napsnet/napsnet-special-reports/%eb%8f%99%eb%b6%81%ec%95%8--%b5-%ec%9c%84%ed%98%91%ec%9d%98-%ec%a2%85%ec%8b%9d/>

Nautilus Institute
608 San Miguel Ave., Berkeley, CA 94707-1535 | Phone: (510) 423-0372 | Email:
nautilus@nautilus.org